DISCUSSION


S. Viswanathan, Flat B-203, Block-B, United Avenue Apts., South End, 7-1-29, Ameerpet, Hyderabad - 500 016, comments:

In the 'Introduction' (p.23), the authors have stated that, 'Although the presence of rare earth elements (REE) in some discrete uranium phases like uraninite and pitchblende has long been known (e.g., Frondel, 1959 and Xu et al. 1981), studies on the REE of the uranium-bearing phases are very few (e.g., Fryer and Taylor, 1987; Pagel et al. 1987)'. Quite obviously, and most surprisingly, they are not aware of the pioneering research done in their own organization (the Atomic Minerals Directorate for Exploration and Research), on the distribution of the REE in uraninites, some 33 years ago, by Dr. A.V. Sankaran and his associates, the results of which were published in the Journal of the Geological Society of India (Sankaran et al. 1970). Furthermore, from the 'References' cited by the authors (p.35), it appears that they are also not aware of the REE data on uranium phases reported by Russian researchers in journals like Geochemistry, Geochemistry International and in the 'Vlasov Volumes'.

Using quantitative emission-spectrography, Sankaran et al. (1970) reported the concentrations of all the 14 naturally-occurring REEs (La, Ce, Pr, Nd, Sm, Eu, Gd, Tb, Dy, Ho, Er, Tm, Yb and Lu) and of Y, Sc, Al, Co, Cu, Ga, Mg, Mn, Mo, Nb, Ni, Ti, V and Zr in pegmatitic and hydrothermal uraninites from India and France. Dhana Raju and Babu (2003) have reported only five REEs (La, Ce, Gd, Dy and Er) in six samples of uraninite (see their Table 2a on p.28).

An unfortunate aspect of contemporary research is the reluctance of investigators to undertake comprehensive literature surveys so as to give due credit to earlier workers. Gone are the days when 'Previous work/studies' used to be an integral and vital section of research papers. Knowledgeable reviewers of papers and editors of journals can reverse this unhealthy trend.

R. Dhana Raju* and E.V.S.S.K. Babu, *3-27, Kavalipuram, (via) Velpur-Tanuku - 534 222, West Godavari District, Andhra Pradesh, reply:

We sincerely thank Dr. S. Viswanathan for drawing our attention to the pioneering work of Sankaran et al. (1970) on the reported contents of REEs in pegmatitic and hydrothermal uraninites from India and France as well as to similar work by some Russian researchers. We regret very much for the inadvertent omission of these in our paper.

References


(Comment received on 21.7.2003 and Reply on 11.8.2003)

JOUR.GEOL.SOC.INDIA, VOL.62, OCT. 2003